Moral Distress & Abortion Restrictions/Bans

Julie Chor, MD, MPH

Associate Professor, The University of Chicago
FIGO World Congress of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Paris
October 10, 2023
Disclosure Slide

- No disclosures.
Learning Objectives

1. Define moral distress
2. Describe how moral distress relates to moral dilemmas and moral injury
3. Discuss how abortion bans can lead to moral distress
4. Identify strategies to try to mitigate potentially morally injurious events to buffer against moral injury
Moral Distress – original definition

- When an individual “knows the right thing to do, but institutional constraints make it nearly impossible to pursue the right course of action.”
  - Andrew Jameton

Jameton A, Nursing Practice: The Ethical Issues, 1984
Moral Distress – broadened definition

- One or more negative self-directed emotions or attitudes that arise in response to one’s perceived involvement in a situation that one perceives to be morally undesirable.
  - *Stephen M. Campbell, Connie M. Ulrich, Christine Grady*

Campbell SM, Ulrich CM, Grady C. *The American Journal of Bioethics, 2016*
Moral Distress – cause & effect

Potentially morally injurious event (PMIE):
Event that is out of an individual’s control has negative effects on personal integrity

Moral Dilemma
Moral Distress
Moral Injury

Persistent response to PMIE 1st described in veterans

Short-term reaction to PMIE 1st described in nursing

Rabin et al. Journal of Healthcare Leadership, 2023
Moral Injury

- Efforts to navigate moral distress → social, psychological, spiritual suffering

- Impact:
  - Feelings of guilt and shame
  - Sense of betrayal
  - Anger
  - Disgust
  - Anxiety
  - Helplessness
  - Isolation
  - Negative thoughts about self, others, world

- Associated with burnout, psychological distress, & decreased well-being

Rabin et al. *Journal of Healthcare Leadership*, 2023
Conscience & Moral Distress

- **Conscience**: “individual’s moral judgement about what is right and wrong and a commitment to act according to core moral values.”
  - *Mara Buchbinder, Dragana Lassiter, Rebecca Mercier, Amy Bryant, Anne Drapkin Lyerly*

- Moral distress long associated with negative claims of conscience (objection/refusal)
  - Also arises from positive claims of conscience (provision)


Harris L, Cooper A, Rasinski K, Curlin F, Drapkin Lyerly A, *Obstet Gynecol, 2011*
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- US Supreme Court *Dobbs v Jackson Women’s Health Organization* June 2022
  - Abortion no longer federally protected
  - Patchwork quilt - abortion banned or permitted

Mexico decriminalizes abortion, extending Latin American trend of widening access to procedure

https://reproductiverights.org/maps/abortion-laws-by-state/
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- US Supreme Court *Dobbs v Jackson Women’s Health Organization* June 2022

Acute change in legal status of care

Potentially morally injurious events

Moral distress

Moral injury
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- Potentially morally injurious events post-Dobbs:
  - Witnessing patient harm in face of unsafe pregnancy
  - Inability to help patients actualize autonomous choices
  - Inability to train students and residents in full spectrum of reproductive healthcare

Desai A, Obstet Gynecol, 2023
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- Potentially morally injurious events post-Dobbs:
  - MFM in Texas reviewing anatomy ultrasound of patient 16 weeks demonstrating fetal anencephaly
  - Laborist in Tennessee diagnosing previable rupture of membranes at 17 weeks
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- Moral distress post-Dobbs:
  - Painful emotions – guilt, shame, anger
  - Painful thoughts – feeling of failure
  - Sensations – nausea, racing heart
  - Urges – withdrawal from others

The New York Times
As Abortion Laws Drive Obstetricians From Red States, Maternity Care Suffers
Some doctors who handle high-risk pregnancies are fleeing restrictive abortion laws. Idaho has been particularly hard hit.

Desai A, Obstet Gyncol, 2023
Moral Distress & Abortion bans

- Approaches to attempt to prevent & mitigate moral injury
  1. **Individual**: Counseling, validation, administrative support/resources
  2. **Group**: Team meetings to discuss & process, peer support groups
  3. **Professional**: Advocacy for policy change and legal protections for healthcare professionals, facilitating training opportunities

Desai A, *Obstet Gynecol*, 2023
Conclusions

- Abrupt legal changes protecting longstanding medical practice → many prevented from providing care they believe to be medically & morally necessary.

- Legal restrictions → potentially morally injurious events, which may → moral distress and injury.

- Sequelae of moral injury can include burnout, depression, workforce depletion.

- Strategies must be employed to prevent/mitigate moral distress and injury.
Thank You